# SH1Wgtnimprovements@nzta.govt.nz

Our website:

www.historicplaceswellington.org

Email:

wgtn@historicplacesaotearoa.org.nz



Contact: Felicity Wong

# **Comments of Historic Places Wellington Inc on SH1 Wellington Improvements**

# 1. Stakeholder Feedback

Historic Places Wellington (HPW) is an incorporated society which aims to identify and protect heritage places in the Wellington region. HPW wishes to be considered as a public stakeholder organisation.

HPW focuses on mitigating the impacts on heritage, a matter of national significance under s.6(f) of the Resource Management Act.

HPW acknowledges the substantial redesign of the road proposal since 2011 in order to retain heritage values associated with the Basin Reserve Heritage Area.

# 2. Summary

HPW has long had concerns about the heritage impacts, particularly on:

- 7 Paterson Street, Waring Taylor/ former Catholic Presbytery a large wooden heritage building nominated for inclusion in HNZPT's list; and
- 19-21 Paterson Street, Ettrick Cottage HNZPT category 2 and WCC District Plan Scheduled

Appendix 1 sets out the heritage values of these places.

This submission proposes options for minimising the heritage impacts if the project proceeds.

- The best outcome for the whole of Paterson Street, Waring Taylor/the Former Catholic Presbytery, and Ettrick Cottage would be that the proposed new tunnel is repositioned to avoid adverse effects on those sites as proposed by LGWM with the "diagonal tunnel".
- However, noting that option has been rejected in favour of the present proposal, HPW supports relocations as a measure of last resort for both Waring Taylor/Former Catholic Presbytery and Ettrick Cottage.
- Section 3 sets out specific proposals for relocations of heritage and character properties to preserve their values and connection with the Mount Victoria Character area.

# 3. Heritage impacts and our proposals

# 3.1. Paterson Street, Mt Victoria

The establishment of a new tunnel to the north of the existing Mount Victoria Tunnel would necessitate the relocation or demolition of the historic Waring Taylor/Former Catholic Presbytery at 7 Paterson St and of listed Category II historic place Ettrick Cottage at 19-21 Paterson St. This will also necessitate the removal of the row of formerly WCC designated character houses which line Paterson Street.

This collection of dwellings, makes a distinct and irretrievable constriction of the southern boundary of historic Mount Victoria, a suburb rich with character housing.

# PROPOSALS for relocations at the end of the project

Ideally the streetscape frontages enjoyed along Paterson Street would be retained by moving the houses to the north on their existing sites, and slightly reordering them to fit the available space after the project is completed. To preserve the wider streetscape, HPW proposes that Paterson Street houses be relocated as follows once the project is complete:

- 145 Brougham St retained on original site
- 147 & 151 Brougham St both relocated to 13 & 15 Paterson St
- 3 & 5 Paterson St both relocated to 19-21 Paterson St (Ettrick Cottage sites)
- 7 Paterson St (Waring Taylor/Former Catholic Presbytery) moved slightly north on existing site & demolition of concrete annex
- 9 & 11 Paterson St moved slightly north on existing sites; and
- 19-21 Paterson St (Ettrick Cottage) relocated to 3-5 Patterson St sites

HPW proposes that 7 Paterson Street be shifted slightly north and accommodated on what will remain of its original site once the street has been moved and the attached concrete dormitory building is demolished. Ettrick Cottage is a smaller building and could be accommodated nearby on

the site currently occupied by two houses at 3 & 5 Paterson Street. Any plan to relocate should ensure that both houses maintain their relationship with the nearby (and formerly surrounding) Mount Victoria Character Areas and relocation should be to sites nearby, and ideally moved slightly within their existing sites.

# PROPOSALS for relocations during project works

We acknowledge that NZTA is planning to use the land on which these houses currently sit as a works site for the project and that an alternative works site would be required (e.g. leasing land from Wellington College, or for temporary storage of the buildings).

Given the practical difficulties involved with moving all these buildings, however, HPW supports focussing on retaining 7 Paterson Street (Waring Taylor/Former Catholic Presbytery) and 19-21 (Ettrick Cottage) within the overall project land in Mt Victoria.

HPW notes that 7 Paterson Street could be accommodated at the end of Brougham Street, while other dwellings are stored elsewhere. In 2011 Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga proposed that the large historic house at 7 Paterson Street be shifted to a larger site at the end of Brougham Street (after removal of the existing houses). It proposed that the smaller Ettrick Cottage be accommodated on the current 7 Paterson Street site.

## 3.2 Other Heritage Impacts

HPW is concerned about the proposed demolition of the early houses in Sussex Street and the old commercial building at the corner of Adelaide Road and Rugby Street. HPW supports sale and removal of other pre-1900 buildings, which are no longer part of early streetscape collections of similar buildings and opposes their demolition.

#### **Home of Compassion Crèche**

The former Home of Compassion Crèche, 1914, is one of New Zealand's first dedicated childcare buildings. The distinctive brick building was designed by prominent architect J S Swan (1874-1936) for the Sisters of Compassion to continue the pioneering crèche service begun by Mother Suzanne Aubert (1835-1926).

HPW welcomes the proposal to shift the Home of Compassion Crèche out of the way of the project works and to retain its important heritage values, including its positioning, if possible, within its original surveyed section - important for the historic relevance of the land purchase by Mother Aubert, and to retain its original orientation and general height with respect to the surrounding ground level. Preventing the intrusion of noise and the visual busyness of the main roads are important to prevent adverse effects on heritage values.

HPW would be concerned to see it lose its connection to Buckle St or for it to be surrounded by major roads or located on a 'traffic island', or surrounded by high buildings. The current site has complimentary landscaping, easy vehicular routes, parking, safe pedestrian ways, visual appreciation opportunities of the Crèche, and high amenity value in available yard space. Much of the heritage value could he retained if those matters continued to be respected.

#### William Wakefield Memorial

The William Wakefield Memorial, HNZPT Category 1, at the Basin Reserve includes the fountain, its surrounds and steps. It is a rare example of a memorial to commemorate the early settlers and settlement of New Zealand. It was erected in 1882 and is significant in Wellington's and New Zealand's history. The Memorial has cultural significance as the oldest feature in the Basin Reserve - witness to over one hundred years of local, national and international events. HPW supports retention and preservation of the Memorial.

#### **East Girls College**

The Wellington East Girls' College Main Building is not expected to be directly affected by the new road, once built. However, construction effects and planning for vehicular, cycle and pedestrian access need to be carefully considered to avoid damage and retain public and student safety.

# 4. Protective measures needed urgently: 7 Paterson St

HPW is concerned that the unoccupied NZTA owned Waring Taylor/Former Catholic Presbytery at 7 Paterson Street is currently at risk from deterioration, unauthorised entry and arson.

## HPW proposes:

- 1. protective boarding up of its windows, security alarm;
- 2. demolition of the attached concrete attached dormitory building which faces Paterson Street;
- 3. ground works to prepare and potentially receive the relocated building about 10 metres north on its existing site;
- 4. Longer term restoration of the building as a community asset, or sold for private use.

Such protective measures are required given the long 10 year time frame envisaged for completion of the project. HPW is concerned that early demolitions of built heritage must not take place when substantive progress is years away.

# **APPENDIX 1: Background information on heritage places**

## 7 Paterson St, Waring Taylor/Former Catholic Presbytery

HPW endorses the heritage impact assessment on Paterson Street provided by Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga (HNZPT) dated August 2011 (NZHPT file number 33002-249).

The former Catholic Presbytery is a large two storey house built in 1869 for the prominent Wellingtonian William Waring Taylor, who made it his home for ten years, and as the Catholic Presbytery. It was the home of the Catholic Archbishop of Wellington from 1909 for nearly 50 years. The Rustic Gothic style of gables, bay windows and substantial form is largely visible - although many of the decorative features have gone and additions have been made.

The former Catholic Presbytery has been nominated for historic place listing by Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga. A preliminary assessment determined that it is a strong candidate for listing. The heritage values attributed to the house include architectural and rarity. It holds significance as one of the early large Mount Victoria houses.

As an 1860's neo-Gothic timber dwelling in a city where there are few houses remaining of this age, it has rarity values. Its associations with people - a Wellingtonian of prominence, and the Catholic Church - over a long period of time are significant. Its strong associations with other Catholic buildings around the Basin, including the Home of Compassion Crèche and St Patrick's College, is relevant. As a pre-1900 building, the site has archaeological values.

Further historical information can be found here: <a href="https://mtvictoria.history.org.nz/7-paterson-street/">https://mtvictoria.history.org.nz/7-paterson-street/</a>

# 19-21 Paterson Street: Ettrick Cottage

Ettrick Cottage, built in the early 1870's and extended in the 1880s, was the home for around 80 years of the Atkins family. It was originally sited at 7 Austin St and is a category 2 HNZPT listed building which recognises its historic and architectural significance as one of the oldest remaining cottages or buildings in the Mount Victoria area.

HPW recommends that NZTA provide land for the building and to relocate it within the Mount Victoria envelope of the project works (i.e. to the site of 3-5 Paterson Street). That would secure "its value as an historic place [which] lies with it being located on its site or at least within Mount Victoria" noted HNZPT in 1994 when it was shifted to its present site.

Further information can be found here: <a href="https://wellingtoncityheritage.org.nz/buildings/1-150/18-ettrick-cottage">https://wellingtoncityheritage.org.nz/buildings/1-150/18-ettrick-cottage</a>